



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Book Reviews

The Laws of Plato. Edited with Introduction and Notes by E. B. ENGLAND. 2 Vols., Manchester (England): University Press, (New York: Longmans, Green and Co.), 1921.

The *Laws*, which the editor aptly calls, "that treasury of pregnant truths which Plato in extreme old age left as his last legacy to humanity," has been too much neglected in modern times, as is proved by the fact that only two commentaries on the whole work have hitherto been published, namely, that of Ast (1814) and that of Stallbaum (1859-60).

Yet there is much to attract one in the *Laws*. It is the maturest work of the great philosopher. In it Plato made an earnest attempt to put his thought about the state into a practical form which might be of real service to mankind. It contains many interesting anticipations of things that are modern. Here is first found the suggestion of free, compulsory, state education and of the extension of these privileges to women in like manner with men (804 c-e). Plato would have children taught number by object lessons and in the course of their play (819b). Indeed, human life itself is to be passed in play and sacrifice and song and dance (803e). The left hand is to be trained like the right (794d). Incompatibility of temper is to be recognized as valid reason for granting divorce (929e-930a). There is even a possible anticipation of the Copernican system (822a, where see Mr. England's note).

It is in this dialogue too that Plato, in a sublime passage, speaks of the kinship between the human soul and the universe: "If, my friend, we say that the whole path and movement of heaven, and all that is therein, is by nature akin to the movement and revolution and calculation of mind, and proceeds by kindred laws (*συγγενῶς ἔρχεται*), then, as is plain, we must say that the best soul takes care of the world and guides it along the good path" (897c, Jowett's translation). We miss here any note by Mr. England, who might appropriately have compared Meno 81c, *τῆς φύσεως ἀπάσης συγγενοῦς οὐδης*, "a tremendous

dogma," as Sir William Temple says, thrown in incidentally (Temple, *Plato and Christianity*, p. 12, London, 1916). Attention may be called also to the fine passage on the pre-eminence and immortality of the soul (956a-c), and to the triumphant funeral honors which are to be paid to the righteous examiners (εὐθνοί, 947). The modern teacher will find quotable Plato's words, τὸ νικᾶν αὐτὸν αὐτὸν πασῶν νικῶν πρώτη τε καὶ ἀρίστη (626e), and perhaps some will smilingly approve the proposed tax on bachelors (721d, 774a)!

And yet, in spite of much that is attractive, there is another aspect of the *Laws* which has deterred many from its study. It was left unfinished and apparently unrevised at the time of Plato's death. Mr. England (Introduction, p. 7) very appropriately quotes Apelt on this point: "The one thing on which the author's heart is set is safely to house a rich harvest, and he does not trouble himself much to sift and arrange his matter by art and rule." Later, the same scholar says that in the *Laws* "we catch Plato at work" (Note ad 633d). The consequence is that there are many difficulties of interpretation and many cases in which the correct reading of the text is uncertain. In his treatment of the text Mr. England is conservative, endeavoring to follow the MSS wherever possible. J. Burnet's text edition (Oxford, 1906) has been made the basis, and variations from the MSS are printed in heavy-faced type. It is a great convenience to the reader, too, that the pages of Stephanus have been indicated at the top of each page of the text and notes. Textual matters are often discussed and the relation of the MSS to each other (e.g. ad764cd, and ad706a). Palaeographical evidence is occasionally adduced (e.g. ad 631b, 767d, 817b). Such expressions as "this very difficult passage," "an embarrassing wealth of thought is here hinted at rather than adequately expressed" are found frequently in the notes. But the difficulties are not passed over, they are fully discussed, opinions of other scholars are cited and weighed, and the editor leaves us in no doubt as to his decision, often making it still more precise by adding his own translation of the words in question. Mr. England's notes, occupying 848 closely printed pages, are truly a labor of great industry as well as of abundant learning. The work is provided also with two good indices and with an analysis of each book.

Mr. England is already well known for his scholarly editions of the *Iph. Aul.* and *Iph. Taur.* of Euripides, and in this new work he

has placed all students of Plato under obligation, and has produced what will doubtless for many years to come be the standard annotated edition of the *Laws*.

FRANK LOWRY CLARK

MIAMI UNIVERSITY

A Study of the Impersonal Passive of the Ventum Est Type. By ALICE ANNA DECKMAN. A thesis presented to the faculty of the graduate school of the University of Pennsylvania in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of doctor of philosophy. Philadelphia, Pa., 1920.

This study is based upon "those authors of the republican period of whom we have works or portions of works preserved substantially entire." The problem is rather narrowly limited to a consideration of the question whether impersonal passives of the type under discussion do or do not imply an actor more specific than "people" or the indefinite "one."

The material collected shows very conclusively that there is some danger that a student may gather a wrong impression from statements in certain grammars, where *curritur* is rendered "they or people run," *vivitur*, "people live," etc. As a matter of fact, it is demonstrated that impersonal expressions of this sort are used much more frequently in describing specific acts than in the expression of general truths.

The dissertation goes little beyond the demonstration of this single fact. In presenting her material, the author attempts to classify according to person and number of an implied agent, beginning with the first person singular. This subdivision is not essential to the main thesis, and it can hardly be made as clear-cut as Miss Deckman would have it.

For example, the first case cited under "actor definite in the second person singular," is Plautus, *Amph.* 100: *numquam factum est*. The scene is the one wherein *Amphitruo* appears at his home shortly after the departure of *Jupiter* and *Mercury*. *Alcmene*, who has not penetrated the disguise of the gods, naturally is surprised at what she considers her husband's quick return; and she declares that she has just seen him. *Amphitruo's* reply *numquam factum est* is taken to mean *numquam fecisti*, i.e., "you never saw me (and *Sosia*) here."

But an argument equally strong could be made out for an implied agent in the first person. Thus, looking backward in the text, it